بسم الله الرحمن الرحيم

Series of Questions Addressed to the Eminent Scholar Ata Bin Khalil Abu Al-Rashtah,

Ameer of Hizb ut Tahrir through his Facebook Page (Fiqhi)

Answer to a Question

The Difference between the Transmission of the Recitation of the Verses of the Quran (Tilawa) and the Transmission of the Script (Rasm) of the Verses of Allah to Us

To: Bakr Ash-Shami

(Translated)

Question:

Assalamu Alaikum Wa Rahmatullah

Can you please explain this Hadith to me, because I have some confusion, which was not قَالَ ابْنُ شِهَابٍ وَأَخْبَرَنِي خَارِجَةُ بْنُ زَيْدِ بْنِ ثَابِتِ سَمِعَ زَيْدَ بْنَ تَعْدَ كُنْتَ أَسْمَعُ زَيْدَ بْنَ تَسْفَابٍ وَأَخْبَرَنِي خَارِجَةُ بْنُ زَيْدِ بْنِ ثَابِتِ سَمِعَ زَيْدَ بْنَ تَسْفَاتِ وَاللَّهِ عليه وسلم يَقْرَأُ بِهَا فَالْتَمَسْنَاهَا فَوَجَدْنَاهَا مَعَ تَأْسَمَعُ زَسُولَ اللَّهِ صلى الله عليه وسلم يَقْرَأُ بِهَا فَالْتَمَسْنَاهَا فَوَجَدْنَاهَا مَعَ تَأْسِتِ قَالَ فَقَدْتُ آيَةً مِنْ الأُخْرَابِ حِينَ نَسَخَنَا المُصْحَفَ قَدْ كُنْتُ أَسْمَعُ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صلى الله عليه وسلم يَقْرَأُ بِهَا فَالْتَمَسْنَاهَا فَوَجَدْنَاهَا مَعَ the Shihab أَسْمَعُ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ عليه والله عليه وسلم يَقْرَأُ مِهَا فَالْتَمَسْنَاهَا فَوَجَدْنَاهَا مَعَ the Shihab

said and Kharijah ibn Zaid Ibn Thabit that he heard Zaid bin Thabit say, "A verse from Surat Ahzab was missed by me when we copied the Qur'an and I used to hear Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) reciting it. So we searched for it and found it with Khuzayma bin Thabit Al-Ansari, and we added it to its Sura in the Mushaf. (That Verse was): "Among the Believers are men who have been true in their covenant with Allah." [Al-Ahzab: 23]"

I still do not understand how the companions accepted it from him, although he is one, and this does not meet the Tawatur (reliable frequency). And if we recognize that his testimony equals two testimonies, it is the same, as it does not reach the Tawatur!

My Allah bless you our Sheikh

Answer:

Wa Alaikum Assalam Wa Rahmatullah Wa Barakatuh

It seems that your confusion is between the transmission of the recitation of the verses of the Qur'an (Tilawa) to us from the Messenger of Allah (saw), and the transmission of the written format, the script (Rasm) of Allah's verses, as they were written in front of the Prophet (saw). The transmission of the recitation of verses is by Tawatur, by groups of the companions, may Allah be pleased with them, from the Messenger of Allah (saw), until it reached us by Tawatur and will be protected by Allah's protection and tawfeeq until the Day of Judgement. Allah (swt) says: أَنَّهُ لَحَافِظُونَ اللَّذَيْنَ وَإِنَّا لَهُ لَحَافِظُونَ اللَّهُ لَحَافِظُونَ اللهُ العَامَ العَامَة ال

its guardian." [Al-Hijr: 9]

As for the transmission of the script (Rasm) of the verses, the companions did not accept to write the verses out of their memorization only, but wanted to collect their writings, which were written in front of the Messenger of Allah (swt). It would have been sufficient to collect the written sheets (suhuf) in the possession of the companions, they however, may Allah be pleased with them have committed to get two witnesses to testify to the authenticity of each sheet, that it was written in front of the Prophet (saw) as an extra precaution, and this is a tawfeeq (success) from Allah (swt) to protect His Book that the falsehood cannot approach it. خَلْفِهِ تَنْزِيلٌ مِنْ جَدِيم حَمِيدِ write it is a state of the sheet it for the falsehood cannot approach it from before it or from behind it; [it is] a

revelation from a [Lord who is] Wise and Praiseworthy." [Fussilat: 42]

This is the issue, and the following is the explanation:

First: The subject of the compilation of the Qur'an:

We have explained the subject of the compilation of the Qur'an in the book, *The Islamic Personality Part I,* the chapter of "Compilation of the Qur'an", as we did in the book "Tayseer Al-

Wusul IIa AI-Usul" under the chapter "The Revelation of the Qur'an and its Script" and "the Compilation of the Qur'an". The enquirer can refer to the two books mentioned above for the details of the matter and the detailed evidences for them... I will quote to you some of what is stated in our books to help you understand the issue correctly, by the permission of Allah (swt):

1- I quote to you from my book, "Tayseer Al-Wusul IIa Al-Usul," under the chapter the "The Compilation of the Quran":

(... Because of the wars of the apostates Abu Bakr, may Allah be pleased with him, feared that a large number of memorizers of the noble Qur'an would be killed (gain martyrdom), they were the ones who memorised its verses arranged in order in their chapters (Surahs), he ordered to collect the verses written for each Surah in one place and arranged in the order approved by the Prophet (saw). The Surahs arranged sequentially that were written in pieces were collected after it was confirmed that they were written before the Prophet (saw), and there was the requirement of the testimony of two companions on each piece written; to testify that it was written before of the Prophet (saw), and they (companions) were not content with the matching of the writing with the memorized verses only. Note that every verse was memorized by a group of companions by tawatur,

So when they found that the last verses of Surat At-Tawba were written by Khuzayma alone, and that it was only Khuzayma (ra) who attested that it was written before the Prophet (saw), they stopped compiling them until they got the evidence that the Messenger of Allah (saw) had adopted that Khuzayma's testimony is equal that of two just Muslims, they then collected that written piece; which Khuzayma testified on. Note that they memorized that verse categorically, but it was for extra confirmation by them, may Allah be pleased with them, because they wanted to collect the sheets (suhuf) written before the Prophet (saw) and not to write them from memory.

Therefore, Abu Bakr al-Siddiq's compilation, was a collection of sheets that have the verses written and arranged in their Surahs as approved by the Prophet (saw) i.e. put the sheets of the verses of each Surah in order behind each other in one place for all the Surahs of the Qur'an) **End.**

2- And I quote you from the Islamic Personality Part I after the compilation of Abu Bakr to the sheets that had the written verses in their Surahs as they were written before in the Messenger of Allah (saw):

(That is why Abu Bakr's (ra) order to compile the Qur'ān was not an order to write it down in one mus'haf, rather it was an order to bring the sheets that had been written in the Messenger's (saw) presence together in one place and it was an order to make certain; that they are in the same form as they were by supporting it with the testimonies of two witnesses... These sheets remained preserved in the possession of Abu Bakr (ra) during his life and then with 'Umar (ra) during his lifetime and them with Hafsa the daughter of 'Umar (ra), the mother of the Believers in accordance with 'Umar's (ra) bequest

This was regarding the compilation of Abu Bakr (ra). As for the compilation of 'Uthman (ra), in the third or (some say) the second year of his Khilafah i.e in the year 25 AH, Huzayfah ibn al-Yaman (ra) approached 'Uthman (ra) in Madinah at the time when the people of al-Sham and the people of Iraq were waging a war to conquer Armenia and Azerbaijan. Hudhayfa (ra) was afraid of their (people of al-Sham and Iraq) differences in the recitation of the Qur'ān.

So he travelled to 'Uthman. Hudhayfa (ra) was afraid of their (the people of al-Sham and Iraq) differences in the recitation of the Qur'ān, so he said to 'Uthman Ameer Al Mumineen! Save this nation before they differ about the Book (Qur'ān) as Jews and the Christians did before.' So 'Uthman (ra) sent a message to Hafsa (ra) saying, 'Send us the manuscripts of the Qur'ān so that we may compile the Qur'ānic materials in perfect copies and return the manuscripts to you.' Hafsa (ra) sent it to 'Uthman (ra). 'Uthman (ra) then ordered Zaid bin Thabit (ra), 'Abd Allah ibn alZubair, Said ibn al-'As and 'Abd al-Rahman ibn Harith ibn Hisham to rewrite the manuscripts in perfect copies. They did so, and when they had written many copies, 'Uthman (ra) returned the original manuscripts to Hafsa (ra). 'Uthman (ra) sent one copy of what they have copies to every Muslim province, and ordered that all the other Qur'ānic materials, whether written in fragmentary manuscripts or whole copies, be burnt. The number of copies made was seven. The seven mus'hafs were sent to Makkah, al-Sham, Yemen, Bahrain, Basra, Kufah, and one copy was kept

in Madinah.

Therefore, 'Uthman's (ra) action was not the compilation of the Qur'ān rather it constituted in only the copying and transcription of the same thing transcribed from the Messenger of Allah (ra) as it was. He did not do anything other than make seven copies from the preserved copy in the possession of Hafsa (ra), the mother of the Believers and unite the people on this single script and forbade any other script or dictation other than it. The matter was settled on this copy as a script and dictation. It is the same script and dictation in which the sheets were written as was written in the presence of Allah's Messenger (ra) when the revelation was revealed. And it is the same copy which Abu Bakr (ra) had compiled. Then the Muslims began to make copies from this copy and not any other copy. Nothing remained except the mus'haf of 'Uthman (ra) in its script. When printers came about, the mushaf was printed from this copy with the same script and dictation).

3- As you can see, the issue was not the transmission of the recitation of the Qur'an, this was transmitted by a group of companions from the Prophet (saw) that is a definite Tawatur, it is a transmission of that which was the written before the Messenger of Allah (saw)... Therefore, this script (Rasm) on the Qur'an is Tawqeefi (must be taken as it and not altered) and must be committed to it alone. It is Haraam to write the Qur'an in any script than this script. It is not permissible to alter it at all... However, we must commit to the Othmani (of Othman (ra)) script of the Qur'an, it is specific to the writing of the whole of the Qur'an, but writing the Qur'an to quote evidence or writing on the board for education or other, or in other place that the Qur'an (Mushaf); it is permissible to write in a different spelling, such as it **usury**".

In the in the Qur'an, can be written on the board as (الريا) because the approval of the Prophet (saw) and the consensus of the companions (ra) was for the Qur'an (mus'haf) alone not anywhere else, and it is not a measure for other things because it is Tawqeefi, has no divine reason, and there is no room for Qiyas here.

Secondly, the subject of the Hadith which you asked about was narrated by al-Bukhari as (4604- حَدَّثَنَا مُوسَى حَدَّثَنَا إِبْرَاهِيمُ حَدَّثَنَا ابْنُ شِهَابٍ أَنَّ أَنَسَ بْنَ مَالِكٍ حَدَّثَهُ أَنَّ حُذَيْفَةَ بْنَ الْيَمَانِ قَدِمَ عَلَى عُثْمَانَ وَكَانَ يُعَازِي :foļlows أَهْلَ الشَّأْمِ فِي فَتْح إرْمِينِيَةَ وَأَذْرَبِيجَانَ مَعَ أَهْلِ الْعِرَاقِ فَأَفْزَعَ حُذَيْفَةَ اخْتَلَافُهُمْ فِي الْقِرَاءَةِ فَقَالَ حُذَيْفَةُ لِغُثْمَانَ يَا أَمِيرَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ أَذْرَكْ هَذِهِ الْإُمَّةَ قَبْلَ أَنْ يَخْتَلِفُوا فِي أَلْكِتَابُ اخْتِلَافَ الْيَهُودِ وَالْنَصَارَى فَأَرْسَلَ عُثْمانُ إِلَى حَفْصَةَ أَنْ أَرْسِلِي إِلَيْنَا بِالصُّحُفِ تَنْسَخُهَا فِي الْمَصَاحِفِ ثُمَّ نَرُدُها إِلَيْكِ فَأَرْ سَلَتُ بِهَا حَفْصَةُ إِلَى عُثْمَانَ فَأَمَرَ زَيْدَ بْنَ ثَابِتٍ وَعَبْدَ اللَّهِ بْنَ الْزُبَيْرِ وَسَعِيدَ بْنَ الْعَاصِ وَ عَبْدَ الرَّحْمَنِ بْنَ الْحَارِثِ بْنِ هِشَامَ فَنَسَخُوهَا فِي الْمَصَاحِفِ وَقَالَ عُثْمَانُ لِلرَّ هْطِ الْقُرَشِيِّينَ الثَّلائَةِ إِذَا اخْتَلَفْتُمُ أَنْتُمْ وَزَيْدُ بْنُ ثَابِتٍ فِي شَيْءٍ مِنْ الْقُرْآنِ فَاكْتُبُوهُ بِلِسَانِ قُرَيْش فَائِمًا نَزَلَ بِلِسَانِهِمْ فَفَعَلُوا حَتَّى إِذَا نَسَخُوا الصُّحْفَ فِي الْمَصَاحِفِ رَدً عُثْمَانُ الصُّحُفَ إِلَى حَفْصَةَ وَأَرْسَلَ إِلَى كُلِّ أَفْقٍ بِمُصْحَفٍ مِمَّا نَسَخُوا وَإِمَرَ بِمَا الْقُرْأَنِ فِي كُلِّ مُتَحِيفَةٍ أَوْ مُصْحَفٍ أَنْ يُحْرَقُ) سِوَاهُ مِنْ الْقُرْأَنِ فِي كُلِّ مُتَحِيفَةٍ أَوْ مُصْحَفٍ أَنْ يُحْرَقُ. that Anas bin Malik told him that Hudhaifa bin Al-Yaman came to `Uthman at the time when the people of Sham and the people of Iraq were w6aging war to conquer Arminya and Adharbijan. Hudhaifa was afraid of their (the people of Sham and Iraq) differences in the recitation of the Qur'an, so he said to `Uthman, "O chief of the Believers! Save this nation before they differ about the Book (Qur'an) as Jews and the Christians did before." So `Uthman sent a message to Hafsa saving, "Send us the manuscripts of the Qur'an so that we may compile the Qur'anic materials in perfect copies and return the manuscripts to you." Hafsa sent it to `Uthman. `Uthman then ordered Zaid bin Thabit, `Abdullah bin AzZubair, Sa`id bin Al-As and `AbdurRahman bin Harith bin Hisham to rewrite the manuscripts in perfect copies. Uthman said to the three Quraishi men, "In case you disagree with Zaid bin Thabit on any point in the Qur'an, then write it in the dialect of Quraish, the Qur'an was revealed in their tongue." They did so, and when they had written many copies, Uthman returned the original manuscripts to Hafsa. Uthman sent to every Muslim province one copy of what they had copied, and ordered that all the other Qur'anic materials, whether written in fragmentary manuscripts or whole copies, be burnt).

was): "Among the Believers are men who have been true in their covenant with Allah." [Al-Ahzab: 23]

It is clear from the Hadith that it is talking about the incident of copying the Qur'an during the reign of Othman, may Allah be pleased with him. He (ra) assigned Zaid Ibn Thabit and the others to copy the Qur'an from the sheets and pieces that were compiled during the time of Abu Bakr (ra), they were in Hafsa's (ra) house. That is, the Hadith is discussing copying from the sheets that were written before the Prophet, and it is not about the transmission of the recitation. So that the Qur'an is written in the same script written in front of the Prophet (saw). This does not need Tawatur necessarily, but it is sufficient to receive a Sahih narration about it. But they, may Allah be pleased with them, have committed to bring two witnesses for the script, out of extra precaution and care. The recitation of the verses of the Qur'an were transmitted to us from groups of companions from the Messenger of Allah.

Thus, the answer to your question has become clear, Allah willing, He (swt) who protected His Book, الأَكْ نَتَنْ الذِّكْرَ وَإِنَّا لَهُ لَحَافِظُونَ﴾ "Indeed, it is We who sent down the Qur'an and indeed, We will be its guardian." [Al-Hijr: 9]

Third, two issues remain to be clarified:

First, what are the verses that were found only written with Khuzayma...

And second, were they found with Khuzaymah or with Abu Khuzayma...

The answer, by Allah's tawfeeq, is the following:

1. As for the first issue concerning the verses, Al-Bukhari has two narrations under No. 4311 and under No. 4604 as follows:

(4311 حدثنا أَبُو الْيَمَانِ أَخْبَرَنَا شُعَبَّ عَنْ الزُّهْرِيَ قَالَ أَخْبَرَنِي ابْنُ السَّبَّاقِ أَنَّ زَيْدَ بْنَ ثَابِتِ الْأَنْصَارِيَّ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ وَكَانَ مِمَّن يَكْتُبُ الْوَحْيَ قَالَ أَرْسَلَ إِلَيَّ أَبُو بَكْرٍ مَقْتَلَ أَهْلِ الْيَمَامَةِ وَعَنْدَهُ عُمَرُ فَقَالَ أَبُو بَكْرٍ إِنَّ عُمَرَ أَتَانِي فَقَالَ إِنَّ الْقَتْلَ قَدْ اسْتَحَرَّ الْقَتْلَ فَدُ اسْتَحَرَّ اللَّهُ مَعَرُ فَقَالَ أَبُو بَكْرٍ مَنْ اللَّهُ مَعَرَ فَقَالَ أَبُو بَكْرٍ مَنْ الْقَرْآنِ إِلَا أَنْ تَجْمَعُوهُ وَإِنِّي لَقَتْلَ اللَّقَرْآنَ قَلْ الْيَمَامَةِ وَعِنْدَهُ عَمَرُ فَقَالَ أَبُو بَكْرٍ إِنَّ عُمَرَ أَتَانِي فَقَالَ إِنَّ اللَّهِ مَ كَثِيلَ مَنْ اللَّهُ اللَّهُ مَعْدَى اللَّهُ مَعْقَلُ عَمَرُ هُوَ وَاللَّهِ حَيْرٌ فَلَمْ يَرَلْ عُمَرُ يَزَلْ عُمَرُ يَذِي فِيهِ حَتَى شَرَحَ اللَّهُ لِذَلِكَ صَدري وَرَأَيْتُ أَلْذِي رَأَى عُمَرُ قَالَ زَيْدُ بْنُ ثَابِتِ وَعُمَرُ عِنْدَهُ جَلِسٌ لَا يَتَكَلَّمُ فَقَالَ أَبُو بَكْرٍ إِنَّا عَمَرُ عَنْنَ عَمَرُ عَلَى مَعَنْ عَنْ عَالَ أَنُو مَعْرَ اللَّهُ مَ فَقَالَ أَنْ وَنَعْنَ عَمْرُ عَالَ وَعُمَرُ عَنْدَا لَهُ مَعَنْهُ اللَهُ مَعْمَالُ اللَهِ مَ عَنْدَهُ مَنْتَ الْمَوْمَى وَيَعْنَى مَ عُمَرُ قَالَ زَيْدُ بْنُ ثَلْنَتَ عَمْدُ عَنْتَيْ عَالَ وَعُمَرُ عِنْدَهُ جَلِسَ لِا لَكَهُ مَ عَنْكَمُ عَنْتَنَعْ عَمَرُ قَالَ أَنُو مَعْمَرَ قَالَ وَلَا يَعْمَنُ عَنْتَنْ عَنْ عَنْ عَنْ الْقَوْنَ اللَهُ مَ عَنْتَ الْقَوْلَ اللَهُ مَ عَنْتَبَعُ مُ الْقُوْلَ الْقُولَ اللَّهُ مَنْ عَنْتَنْ عَنْتَ عَنْتَ عَنْ مَنْ عَنْ عَنْتَنْ عَنْ عَنْ عَنْتَ عَمَى اللَهُ مَ عَنْ عَمَى قَاللَهُ لَوْ عَلْنَ عَنْ اللَّهُ عَالَهُ الْنُهُ مَعْذَى الْنَهُ مَنْ عَنْ عَنْتَنْ عَانَ أَنْ عَنْتَنْ عَنْتَنْ عَنْتَ عَنْ عَنْ عَلَى مَ عَنْ عَنْ عَنْ عَنْ الْعَنْ عَلَى عَنْ عَنْ عَلْهُ عَنْ عَنْ عَلَى مَنْ عَنْ عَنْ عَلَى عَنْ عَنْ عَنْ عَنْ عَنْتَ عَنْ الْقَوْنَ عَنْ عَلَى عَلَى الْقَتُ عَمْنَ عَمَنَ عَمَنَ قَالَ اللَهُ مَنْ عَنْ عَنْ عَمْنَ عَنْدَهُ عَلَى عُنْ عَنْتَكَمُ عَنْ عَالَ عَنْ عَنْ عَلَى مَا عَنْ عَمْ مَ عَنْ الْقَوْنُ الْقَوْنُ عَنْ عَنْ عَنْ عَلْ عَ عَنْتَ مَا عَنْتَ عَمْ عَنْعَنُ عَنْ اللَّهُ مَا عَو

First: (4311- Abu Al-Yaman told us, Shu'aib told us from Az-Zahri, he said, Ibn As-SAbbag told me that Zaid Ibn Thabit Al-Ansari (ra), who was one of those who used to write the Divine Revelation: Abu Bakr sent for me after the (heavy) casualties among the warriors (of the battle) of Yamama (where a great number of Qurra' were killed). `Umar was present with Abu Bakr who said, `Umar has come to me and said, The people have suffered heavy casualties on the day of (the battle of) Yamama, and I am afraid that there will be more casualties among the Qurra' (those who know the Qur'an by heart) at other battle-fields, whereby a large part of the Qur'an may be lost, unless you collect it. And I am of the opinion that you should collect the Qur'an." Abu Bakr added, "I said to `Umar, 'How can I do something which Allah's Apostle has not done?' `Umar said (to me), 'By Allah, it is (really) a good thing.' So `Umar kept on pressing, trying to persuade me to accept his proposal, till Allah opened my bosom for it and I had the same opinion as `Umar." (Zaid bin Thabit added:) `Umar was sitting with him (Abu Bakr) and was not speaking. me). "You are a wise young man and we do not suspect you (of telling lies or of forgetfulness): and you used to write the Divine Inspiration for Allah's Messenger (3). Therefore, look for the Qur'an and collect it (in one manuscript). "By Allah, if he (Abu Bakr) had ordered me to shift one of the mountains (from its place) it would not have been harder for me than what he had ordered me concerning the collection of the Qur'an. I said to both of them, "How dare you do a thing which the Prophet has not done?" Abu Bakr said, "By Allah, it is (really) a good thing. So I kept on arguing with him about it till Allah opened my bosom for that which He had opened the bosoms of Abu Bakr and `Umar. So I started locating Qur'anic material and collecting it from parchments, scapula, leaf-stalks of date palms and from the memories of men (who knew it by heart). I found with Khuza`ima two Verses of Surat-at-Tauba which I had not found with anybody

else, (and they were):-- "Verily there has come to you an Apostle (Muhammad) from amongst yourselves. It grieves him that you should receive any injury or difficulty He (Muhammad) is ardently anxious over you (to be rightly guided)" (9.128) The manuscript on which the Qur'an was collected, remained with Abu Bakr till Allah took him unto Him, and then with `Umar till Allah took him unto Him, and finally it remained with Hafsa, `Umar's daughter.)

As is the text of the Hadith, it was in the era of Abu Bakr, may Allah be pleased with him and it is clear that the written sheet that they found with Khuzayma contained the last two verses of Surah At-Tawbah (لله عَنَيْمُ عَزِيزٌ عَلَيْهِ مَا عَنِتُمْ حَرِيصٌ عَلَيْكُمُ has come to you an Apostle (Muhammad) from amongst yourselves. It grieves him that you should receive any injury or difficulty He (Muhammad) is ardently anxious over you (to be rightly guided)" [At-Tawba: 128].

والثانية: (4604- حَدَّثَنَا مُوسَى حَدَّثَنَا إبْرَاهِيمُ حَدَّثَنَا ابْنُ شِهَابِ أَنَّ أَنَسَ بْنَ مَالِكٍ حَدَّثَهُ أَنَّ حُدَيْفَةَ بْنَ الْيَمَانِ قَدِمَ عَلَى عُثْمَانَ وَكَانَ يُعَازِي أَهْلَ الشَّلْم فِي قَتْح إرْمِينِيَةَ وَأَذْربِيجَانَ مَعَ أَهْلِ الْعِرَاقِ فَأَفْزَعَ حُدَيْفَةَ اخْتِلَافُهُمْ فِي الْقِرَاءَةِ فَقَالَ حُدَيْفَةَ لِعُثْمَانَ يَا أَمِيرَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ أَدْرِكُ هَذِهِ الْمُثَةَ قَبْلَ أَنْ يَخْتَلُفُوا فِي الْكِتَابِ اخْتِلَاف الْيُهُودِ وَالنَّصَارَى فَأَرْسَلَ عُثْمَانَ إلى حَفْصَةَ أَنْ أَنْ سِلِي إِلَيْنَا بِالصَّحُف نَسْحُهَا فِي الْمَصَاحِفِ ثُمَّ تَرُدُّها إلَيْكِ فَأَرْسَلَتْ بهَا حَقْصَةُ إِلَى عُثْمَانَ فَأَمَرَ زَيْدَ بْنَ ثَابِت وَ عَبْدَ اللَّهُ بْنَ الْزُبِيرِ وَسَعِيدَ بْنَ الْعَصَوَ وَعَنْدَ الْحَمَانِ فَوَ عَبْدَ اللَّهُ مَنْ الْدُولَا ثُمَّ تَرُدُها إلَيْكِ فَأَرْسَلَتْ بِهَا حَقْصَةُ إِلَى عُثْمَانَ فَأَمَرَ زَيْدَ بْنَ ثَابِت وَ عَبْدَ اللَّه بْنَ الْزُبْيَرِ وَسَعِيدَ بْنَ الْعَصَو وَعَبْدَ الرَّحْمَنِ نَا الْحَارِبُ بْنِ هِثَنَام قَنَسَخُوهُ هَ فَيْنَا الللَيْكِ فَأَنْ سَلَتْ بِهَا حَقْصَةُ إِلَى عُثْمَانَ لِلرَّهُمَ وَعَبْدَ اللَّهُ مَن قَنَسَخُوهُ هَيْ الْمَصَاحِفِ وَقَالَ عُثْمَانُ لِلرَّهُمِ الْقُرَشِيينَ الثَّلَاثَةُ أَنَّهُ وَيَ فَتَع وَيَنْ الْأَسِيْنِ فَا الْمَالَيْ فَلَ اللَّعُرَق الْقَرَشِينَ الْتُعَانَ اللَّهُ مُنَ أَنْ الْتِرَا فَي قَتَلَ

Second: (4604 - Musa told us, Ibrahim told us, Ibn Shihab told us that Anas bin Malik told him that Hudhaifa bin Al-Yaman came to `Uthman at the time when the people of Sham and the people of Iraq were Waging war to conquer Arminya and Adharbijan. Hudhaifa was afraid of their (the people of Sham and Iraq) differences in the recitation of the Qur'an, so he said to `Uthman, "O chief of the Believers! Save this nation before they differ about the Book (Qur'an) as Jews and the Christians did before." So `Uthman sent a message to Hafsa saying, "Send us the manuscripts of the Qur'an so that we may compile the Qur'anic materials in perfect copies and return the manuscripts to you." Hafsa sent it to `Uthman. `Uthman then ordered Zaid bin Thabit, `Abdullah bin AzZubair, Sa`id bin Al-As and `AbdurRahman bin Harith bin Hisham to rewrite the manuscripts in perfect copies. `Uthman said to the three Quraishi men, "In case you disagree with Zaid bin Thabit on any point in the Qur'an, then write it in the dialect of Quraish, the Qur'an was revealed in their tongue." They did so, and when they had written many copies, `Uthman returned the original manuscripts to Hafsa. `Uthman sent to every Muslim province one copy of what they had copied, and ordered that all the other Qur'anic materials, whether written in fragmentary manuscripts or whole copies, be burnt.)

قَالَ ابْنُ شِهَابٍ وَأَخْبَرَنِي خَارِجَةُ بْنُ زَيْدِ بْنِ ثَابِتٍ سَمِعَ زَيْدَ بْنَ ثَابِتٍ قَالَ فَقَدْتُ آيَةً مِنْ الْأَحْزَابِ حِينَ نَسَخْنَا الْمُصْحَفَ قَدْ كُنْتُ أَسْمَعُ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ م يَقْرَأُ بِهَا فَالْتَمَسْنَاهَا فَوَجَدْنَاهَا مَعَ خُرَيْمَةَ بْنِ تَابِتٍ الْأَنْصَارِيِّ هِمِنْ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ رِجَالٌ صَدَقُوا مَا عَاهَدُوا اللَّهَ عَلَيْهِ، فَأَلْحَقْنَاهَا فِي سُورَتِهَا فِي الْمُصْحَفِ.)،

(Ibn Shihab said and Kharijah ibn Zaid Ibn Thabit that he heard Zaid bin Thabit say, "A verse from Surat Ahzab was missed by me when we copied the Qur'an and I used to hear Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) reciting it. So we searched for it and found it with Khuzayma bin Thabit Al-Ansari, and we added it to its Sura in the Mushaf. (That Verse was): "Among the Believers are men who have been true in their covenant with Allah." [Al-Ahzab: 23]

From the text of the Hadith <u>it is at the time of Othman (ra) and it it clear that the sheet</u> <u>they found with Khuzaymah was the verse from Surat Al-Ahzab</u>: إللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ **Among the Believers are men who have been true in their covenant with Allah.**" [Al-Ahzab: 23]

With a closer look at the Hadiths (4311) and (4604), which were narrated by al-Bukhari, i.e. they are Sahih in narration (Sanad), it is clear that:

A- In the beginning, we make clear that the two hadiths are not about the tawatur of the verses. In both narrations, the subject is about the script and not about the Tawatur of memorization. Each verse was memorized by a group of companions of the Prophet (saw). The companions wanted to transmit the exact script written in front of the Prophet (saw), they did not want the people to write according to their memorization leading to different letters, but they wanted to write the verses with the same script that was written before the Prophet of Allah

(saw). Out of extra precaution and tawfeeq from Al-Aziz, Al-Hakim who says: ﴿إِنَّا نَحْنُ نَزَّلْنَا الذِّكْرَ وَإِنَّا لَهُ "Indeed, it is We who sent down the Qur'an and indeed, We will be its guardian." [Al-Hijr: 9]

This is why the Shar'i rule was extrapolated, that it is not permissible to print the Mushaf except in the Othmani script, Othman may Allah be pleased with him.

B- The collection of written sheets were in the era of Abu Bakr as stated in the Sahih evidences, adopting the two witnesses on each sheet is also Sahih... During the reign of Othman, may Allah be pleased with him, copies of the Qur'an from the compiled sheets in the era of Abu Bakr were made, which at the time of copying were with Hafsa, may Allah be pleased with her, Othman asked that it should be brought and he commissioned Zaid and the three who were with him to make a number of copies of the Qur'an from these sheets.

<u>There is no room here, that is, in the reign of Othman, for the loss of a written sheet, this if</u> any would have happened at collecting the sheets during the reign of Abu Bakr, that is, the sheet on which the last two verses of At-Tawba were written: هَا عَنِيَّمُ عَزِيزٌ عَلَيْهِ مَا عَنِيَّمُ عَزِيزٌ عَلَيْهِ مَا عَنِيَّمُ حَرِيصٌ There has عَلَيْهُمُ بِالْمُؤْمِنِينَ رَءُوفٌ رَحِيمٌ * فَإَنْ تَوَلَّوْا فَقُلْ حَسْبِيَ اللَّهُ لَا إِلَهُ إِلَهُ إِلَهُ وَا

certainly come to you a Messenger from among yourselves. Grievous to him is what you suffer; [he is] concerned over you and to the believers is kind and merciful * But if they turn away, [O Muhammad], say, "Sufficient for me is Allah; there is no deity except Him. On Him I have relied, and He is the Lord of the Great Throne." [At-Tawba: 128-129]

So the sheet was not at the time of copying during the reign of Othman, because the compilation was at the time of Abu Bakr and not Othman, therefore the last Hadith of Al-Bukhari, (قَالَ ابْنُ شِهَابِ وَأَخْبَرَنِي خَارِجَةُ بْنُ زَيْدِ بْنَ ثَابِتِ سَمِعَ زَيْدَ بْنَ ثَابِتِ سَمَعَ زَيْدَ بْنَ ثَابِتِ مَعْ فَرُيْنِي أَنْ الله عليه وسلم يَقْزَ أَبِهَا فَالْتَمَسْنَاهَا فَوَجَدْنَاهَا مَعَ خُزَيْمَة بْنِ أَنَّهُ صَدَقُوا اللَّهِ صلى الله عليه وسلم يَقْزَأُ بِهَا فَالْتَمَسْنَاهَا فَوَجَدْنَاهَا مَعَ خُزَيْمَة بْن

and Kharijah ibn Zaid Ibn Thabit that he heard Zaid bin Thabit say, "A verse from Surat Ahzab was missed by me when we copied the Qur'an and I used to hear Allah's Messenger (ﷺ) reciting it. So we searched for it <u>and found it with Khuzayma bin Thabit Al-Ansari, and we added it to its Sura in the Mushaf. (That Verse was): "Among the Believers are men who have been true in their covenant with Allah.' [Al-Ahzab: 23]</u>

2- As for the second issue, which is, was the companion whom Zaid found the two verses of At-Tawba with, in a written sheet, and did not find it with anyone else, Khuzayma or Abu Khuzayma? The answer is as follows:

- Al-Bukhari narrated the two versions: (4311) and (4603

The narration number 4311 mentioned above, states:

[So I started looking for the Qur'an and collecting it from (what was written on) palms stalks, thin white stones and also from the men who knew it by heart, till I found the last Verse of Surat at-Tauba (Repentance) with Abi Khuzaima Al-Ansari, and I did not find it with anybody other than him. The Verse is: (مَوْفَ رَحِيمٌ * فَإِنْ تَوَلَّوْا فَقُلْ عَنِيرٌ عَلَيْهِ مَا عَنِيَّمُ حَرِيصٌ عَلَيْكُمْ بِالْمُؤْمِنِينَ رَءُوفٌ رَحِيمٌ * فَإِنْ تَوَلَّوْا فَقُلْ الله عَزِيرٌ عَلَيْهِ مَا عَنِيَّمُ حَرِيصٌ عَلَيْكُمْ بِالْمُؤْمِنِينَ رَءُوفٌ رَحِيمٌ * فَإِنْ تَوَلَّوْا فَقُلْ (Muhammad) from amongst yourselves. It grieves him that you should receive any injury or difficulty.(till the end of Surat-Baraa" [at-Tauba:128-129]).

[4603- Musa Ibn Ismail told us from Ibrahim Ibn Saad, told us, Ibn Shihab told us from Ubaid Ibn As-Sabbag that Zaid Ibn Thabit (ra) said: Abu Bakr As-Siddig sent for me when the people of Yamama had been killed (i.e., a number of the Prophet's Companions who fought against Musailima). (I went to him) and found `Umar bin Al- Khattab sitting with him. Abu Bakr then said (to me), "`Umar has come to me and said: "Casualties were heavy among the Qurra' of the Qur'an (i.e. those who knew the Qur'an by heart) on the day of the Battle of Yamama, and I am afraid that more heavy casualties may take place among the Qurra' on other battlefields, whereby a large part of the Qur'an may be lost. Therefore I suggest, you (Abu Bakr) order that the Qur'an be collected." I said to `Umar, "How can you do something which Allah's Apostle did not do?" `Umar said, "By Allah, that is a good project." `Umar kept on urging me to accept his proposal till Allah opened my chest for it and I began to realize the good in the idea which `Umar had realized." Then Abu Bakr said (to me). 'You are a wise young man and we do not have any suspicion about you, and you used to write the Divine Inspiration for Allah's Messenger (#). So you should search for (the fragmentary scripts of) the Qur'an and collect it in one book." By Allah If they had ordered me to shift one of the mountains, it would not have been heavier for me than this ordering me to collect the Qur'an. Then I said to Abu Bakr, "How will you do something which Allah's Messenger (3) did not do?" Abu Bakr replied, "By Allah, it is a good project." Abu Bakr kept on urging me to accept his idea until Allah opened my chest for what He had opened the chests of Abu Bakr and `Umar. So I started looking for the Qur'an and collecting it from (what was written on) palme stalks, thin white stones and also from the men who knew it by heart, till I found the last Verse of Surat at-Tauba (Repentance) with Abi Khuzaima Al-Ansari, and I did not find it with anybody other than him. The Verse is: "Verily there has come unto you an Apostle (Muhammad) from amongst yourselves. It grieves him that you should receive any injury or difficulty.. (till the end of Surat-Baraa" [at-Tauba 9.128-129]. Then the complete manuscripts (copy) of the Qur'an remained with Abu Bakr till he died, then with `Umar till the end of his life, and then with Hafsa, the daughter of `Umar.]

It is clear from his saying: آفَتَنَبَّعْتُ الْقُرْآنَ أَجْمَعُهُ مِنْ الْعُسُبِ وَاللِّحَافِ وَصُدُور الرَجَالِ حَتَّى وَجَدْتُ آخِرَ سُورَةِ التَّوْبَةِ مَعَ : [فَتَتَبَعْتُ الْقُرْآنَ آَجْمَعُهُ مِنْ الْعُسُبِ وَاللِّحَافِ وَصُدُور الرَجَالِ حَتَّى وَجَدْتُ آخِرَ سُولَ مِنْ أَنْفُسِكُمْ عَزِيزٌ عَلَيْهِ مَا عَنِتُمْ حَتَى خَاتِمَةِ بَرَاءَةً] [ooking for the Qur'an and collecting it from (what was written on) palme stalks, thin white stones and also from the men who knew it by heart, till I found the last Verse of Surat At-Tawba (Repentance) with <u>Abi Khuzaima Al-Ansari</u>, and I did not find it with anybody other than him. The Verse is: الله عَزِيزٌ عَلَيْهُ مَا عَنِتُمُ : الْفُسِحُمُ عَزِيزٌ عَلَيْهِ مَا عَنِتُمُ اللهُ وَاللَّذَانِ الْعُسَلِمُ عَزَيزٌ عَلَيْهِ مَا عَنَتُمُ اللَّذَانِ اللَّعَانَ اللَّهُ مَا عَزَيْنُ الْعُسَلِمُ اللَّهُ عَزَيزٌ عَلَيْهُ مَا عَزَيْ اللَّهُ اللَّهُ اللَّهُ عَذَى اللَّهُ عَزَيزٌ عَلَيْهِ مَا عَنْتُمَ اللَّهُ عَزَيزٌ عَلَيْهُ مَا عَنْتُمُ اللَّهُ اللَّهُ عَزَيزٌ عَلَيْهُ مَا عَزَيْ اللَّهُ عَزَيْنَ الْعُسَلِمُ مَنْ اللَّهُ عَزَيْزٌ عَلَيْهِ مَا عَنْتُمَ اللَّهُ وَاللَّهُ اللْ والمَعْدُ جَاءَكُمُ رَسُولٌ مِنْ أَنْفُسِكُمْ عَزِيزٌ عَلَيْهِ مَا عَنْتُهُ (Muhammad) from amongst yourselves. It grieves him that you should receive any injury or difficulty..(till the end of Surat-Baraa" [At-Tauba: 128-129].

And by looking carefully and reflecting on what was said in the two Hadiths, it is clear that the companion's name is Khuzayma ibn Thabit al-Ansari and not Abu Khuzayma, and the evidence for this is that Abu Bakr, may Allah be pleased with him, stipulated that two witnesses have to testify on the sheet mentioned; that it was written in front of the Messenger of Allah (saw). Zaid found two witnesses for every written verse that he adopted except the last two verses of Surat At-Tawba. He found it written on a sheet only with Khuzaymah in a narration, and with Abu Khuzaymah in another narration, and the result was the adoption of the sheet. Therefore the one it is found with must be the one with a testimony that is equal to the testimony of two, otherwise the sheet would have not been adopted as Abu Bakr has instructed, may Allah be pleased with **him.** What is Sahih from the Messenger of Allah (saw) is that the testimony equivalent to the testimony of two is that of Khuzayma ibn Thabit al-Ansari, as if that Hadith is for this case; the compilation of the written sheet. Glory be to Allah Al-Aziz al-Hakim the Protector for His Book; its recitation and script. The Hadith of Khuzaymah is as follows: Narrated by Ahmad in his Musnad and Abu Daud in his Sunan and the words are Ahmad's:

(حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو الْيَمَانِ حَدَّثَنَا شُعَيْبٌ عَنِ الزُّهْرِيِّ حَدَّثَنِي عُمَارَةُ بْنُ خُزَيْمَةَ الأَنْصَارِيُّ أَنَّ عَمَّهُ حَدَّثَهُ وَهُوَ مِنْ أَصْحَابِ النَّبِيِّ م أَنَّ النَّبِيَّ م ابْتَاعَ فَرَساً مِنْ أَعْرَابِي فَاسْتَثْبَعَهُ النَّبِيُ م لِيَقْضِيَهُ ثَمَنَ فَرَسِهِ فَاسْرَعَ النَّبِيُّ م فَيْسَاوِمُونَ بِالْفَرَسِ لَا يَشْعُرُونَ أَنَّ النَّبِيَّ م ابْتَاعَهُ حَتَّى زَادَ بَعْضُهُمْ الأَعْرَابِيَ في السَّوْمِ عَلَى ثَمَن أَعْرَابِي الأعربي في السَّوْمِ عَلَى ثَمَن الْفَرَسِ الَّذِي النَّبِيَّ م ابْتَاعَهُ حَتَّى زَادَ بَعْضُهُمْ الأَعْرَابِيَ فِي السَّوْمِ عَلَى ثَمَن الْفَرَسِ الَّذِي ابْتَاعَهُ بِهِ النَّبِيُّ م الأَعْرَابِيُ النَّبِيَّ مَ فَقَالَ إِنْ كُنْتَ مُبْتَاعَا هَذَا الْفَرَسَ فَائِتَعْهُ وَإِلَّا بِعُنْهُ فَقَام النَّبِيُّ م الأَعْرَابِيُ لَانَبِي مَا لَعْرَابِي فَقَالَ إِنْ كُنْتَ مُبْتَاعَا هَذَا الْفَرَسَ فَائَتَعْهُ وَإِلَّا مِنْتَ الأَعْرَابِيُ النَّبِيُ مَ وَاللَّهِ مَا بِعْتُكَ فَقَالَ إِنْ كُنْتَ مُبْتَاعَا هَذَا الْفَرَسَ فَائَتَعُهُ وَإِلَّا مِنْتَبِي م النَّبِيّ ρ وَمُرَاجَعَةِ الْأَعْرَابِيِّ فَطَفِقَ الْأَعْرَابِيُّ يَقُولُ هَلُمَّ شَهِيداً يَشْهَدُ أَنِّي بَايَعْتُكَ قَالَ خُزَيْمَةُ أَنَا أَشْهَدُ أَنَّكَ قَدْ بَايَعْتَهُ فَأَقْبَلَ النَّبِيُّ ρ عَلَى خُزَيْمَةً فَقَالَ بِمَ تَشْهَدُ فَقَالَ بِتَصْدِيقِكَ يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ فَجَعَلَ النَّبِيُّ ρ شَهَادَةَ خُزَيْمَةَ شَهَادَةَ رَجُلَيْنِ)

Narrated Uncle of Umarah ibn Khuzaymah:

(Abu Al-Yaman told us, Shuaib told us from Az-Zahri, he told me, Umara Ibn Khuzayma Al-Ansari, that his uncle, who was a companion of the prophet, told him, that the Prophet (3) bought a horse from a Bedouin. The Prophet ([#]) took him with him to pay him the price of his horse. The Messenger of Allah (3) walked quickly and the Bedouin walked slowly. The people stopped the Bedouin and began to bargain with him for the horse as and they did not know that the Prophet (ﷺ) had bought it.

The Bedouin called the Messenger of Allah ([#]) saying: If you want this horse, (then buy it), otherwise I shall sell it. The Prophet (3) stopped when he heard the call of the Bedouin, and said: Have I not bought it from you? The Bedouin said: I swear by Allah, I have not sold it to you. The Prophet (3) said: Yes, I have bought it from you. The Bedouin began to say: Bring a witness. Khuzayma ibn Thabit then said: I bear witness that you have bought it. The Prophet (3) turned to Khuzaymah and said: On what (grounds) do you bear witness?

He said: By considering you trustworthy, Messenger of Allah (#)! The Prophet (#) made the witness of Khuzayma equivalent to the witness of two people). This was also narrated by Al-Hakim in Al-Mustadrak on the two Sahihs and said: (this is a Sahih HAdith in sanad (narration), and the narrators (men) are trustworthy, according to the agreement of the two Sheikhs, but they did not narrate it).

All this proves that the companion with whom the written sheet of the verses of At-Tawbah was found, and was not found with anyone else is Khuzayma, not Abu Khuzayma, because the verse was adopted because the testimony of the bearer is equal to two witnesses. This is true for Khuzayma and not Abu Khuzayma and it seems that the names were confused, this happens sometimes... In any case it is Khuzayma ibn Thabit al-Ansari as shown above.

Thus, the answer has met your question... The answer is also on the two issues above... Allah knows Best and is the Most Wise.

Your brother,

Ata Bin Khalil Abu Al-Rashtah 12 Rabii' Al-Awwal 1441 AH

9/11/2019 CE

The link to the answer from the Ameer's Facebook page:

https://web.facebook.com/AmeerhtAtabinKhalil/photos/a.122855544578192/1190177001179369/ ?type=3&theater