

**Answer to Question**

**الْحَلَالُ بَيِّنٌ وَالْحَرَامُ بَيِّنٌ**

**The Permissible is Clear and the Forbidden is Clear**

To: Hussain Khamaisah

(Translated)

**Question:**

Assalam Alaikum Wa Rahmatullah Wa Barakatuh

Our Ameer and our beloved, may Allah be pleased with you and protect with that He preserved His Book and His allies.

It was mentioned in the 'Dosiya' of "Removing Dust from the Roots", p. 58, the first paragraph of the Hadith, الْحَلَالُ بَيِّنٌ وَالْحَرَامُ بَيِّنٌ "What is permissible is clear and what is forbidden is clear... and whoever falls into doubtful things is like a shepherd..." it seems that "falling into what is Haram" is omitted. Please verify and if you may kindly respond. May Allah protect and guard you our dearest... with much love and respect.

**Answer:**

**Wa Alaikum Assalam Wa Rahmatullah Wa Barakatuh**

May Allah bless you and bless by you for your good supplication, sincere speech, and kind words. May Allah protect you from all bad and shield you from all evil..

Regarding the noble Hadith, "The permissible is clear and the forbidden is clear....", what we mentioned in Al-Kurrassah is the Hadith of Al-Bukhari, and it is in the wording given:

(سمعت رسول الله ﷺ يقول: «الْحَلَالُ بَيِّنٌ وَالْحَرَامُ بَيِّنٌ، وَبَيْنَهُمَا مُشَبَّهَاتٌ لَا يَعْلَمُهَا كَثِيرٌ مِنَ النَّاسِ، فَمَنْ اتَّقَى الْمُشَبَّهَاتِ اسْتَبْرَأَ لِدِينِهِ وَعَرْضِهِ، وَمَنْ وَقَعَ فِي الشُّبُهَاتِ كَرَّاعٍ يَزْعَى حَوْلَ الْحِمَى يُوشِكُ أَنْ يُوَاقِعَهُ، أَلَا وَإِنَّ لِكُلِّ مَلِكٍ حِمَى، أَلَا إِنَّ حِمَى اللَّهِ فِي أَرْضِهِ مَحَارِمُهُ أَلَا وَإِنَّ فِي الْجَسَدِ مُضْغَةً إِذَا صَلَحَتْ صَلَحَ الْجَسَدُ كُلُّهُ وَإِذَا فَسَدَتْ فَسَدَ الْجَسَدُ كُلُّهُ أَلَا وَهِيَ الْقَلْبُ» (I heard Allah's Messenger (saw) saying, "Both legal and illegal things are evident but in between them there are doubtful (suspicious) things and most of the people have no knowledge about them. So whoever saves himself from these suspicious things saves his religion and his honor. And whoever indulges in these suspicious things is like a shepherd who grazes (his animals) near the Hima (private pasture) of someone else and at any moment he is liable to get in it. (O people!) Beware! Every king has a Hima and the Hima of Allah on the earth is His illegal (forbidden) things. Beware! There is a piece of flesh in the body if it becomes good (reformed) the whole body becomes good but if it gets spoilt the whole body gets spoilt and that is the heart." (Narrated by Al-Bukhari.)

As for your observation about the omission of the word "he fell into Haram" it is not in Al-Bukhari's narration, but rather it is mentioned in Muslim's narration like this:

(Sahih Muslim (8/290)

2996- Muhammad bin Abdullah bin Numayr Al-Hamdani told us, my father told us, Zakariya' told us, on the authority of Al-Sha'bi from An-Nu'man bin Bashir (ra) narrated, I heard Allah's Messenger (saw) saying, «وَأَهْوَى النَّعْمَانُ بِإصْبَعَيْهِ إِلَى أُذُنَيْهِ إِنَّ الْحَلَالَ بَيِّنٌ وَإِنَّ الْحَرَامَ بَيِّنٌ وَبَيْنَهُمَا مُشَبَّهَاتٌ لَا يَعْلَمُهُنَّ كَثِيرٌ مِنَ النَّاسِ فَمَنْ اتَّقَى الشُّبُهَاتِ اسْتَبْرَأَ لِدِينِهِ وَعَرْضِهِ وَمَنْ وَقَعَ فِي الشُّبُهَاتِ وَقَعَ فِي الْحَرَامِ كَالرَّاعِي يَزْعَى حَوْلَ الْحِمَى يُوشِكُ أَنْ يَرْتَعَ فِيهِ أَلَا وَإِنَّ لِكُلِّ مَلِكٍ حِمَى أَلَا وَإِنَّ حِمَى اللَّهِ مَحَارِمُهُ أَلَا وَإِنَّ فِي الْجَسَدِ مُضْغَةً إِذَا صَلَحَتْ صَلَحَ الْجَسَدُ كُلُّهُ وَإِذَا فَسَدَتْ فَسَدَ الْجَسَدُ كُلُّهُ أَلَا وَهِيَ الْقَلْبُ» (Nu'man pointed with his two fingers to his ears) 'Both lawful (Halal) and unlawful things (Haram) are evident but in between them there are doubtful things and most people have no knowledge about them. So he, who saves himself from these doubtful things, saves his religion and his honor (i.e. keeps them blameless). And he who indulges in

these doubtful things is like a shepherd who pastures (his animals) near the Hima (private pasture) of someone else and at any moment he is liable to get in it. (O people!) Beware! Every king has a Hima and the Hima of Allah on the earth is what He declared unlawful (Haram). Beware In the body there is a piece of flesh if it becomes sound and healthy, the whole body becomes sound and healthy but if it gets spoilt, the whole body gets spoilt and that is the heart.”

**As you can see, Al-Bukhari did not mention it in his narration, and both narrations are authentic. It was stated in Fath Al-Bari on Al-Bukhari’s narration:**

[Fath Al-Bari by Ibn Hajar (1/82)

50- From Abu Nu’aim, from Zakariya’, from ‘Amir he said I heard An-Nu’man bin Bashir say:

«سَمِعْتُ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ ﷺ يَقُولُ الْخَلَالَ بَيْنَ وَالْحَرَامِ بَيْنَ وَبَيْنَهُمَا مُشَبَّهَاتٌ لَا يَعْلَمُهَا كَثِيرٌ مِنَ النَّاسِ فَمَنْ اتَّقَى الْمَشَبَّهَاتِ اسْتَبْرَأَ لِدِينِهِ وَعَرْضِهِ وَمَنْ وَقَعَ فِي الشَّبَّهَاتِ كَرَّاعَ يَزْعَى حَوْلَ الْجَمَى يُوشِكُ أَنْ يُوَاقِعَهُ أَلَا وَإِنَّ لِكُلِّ مَلِكٍ حِمَى أَلَا إِنَّ حِمَى اللَّهِ فِي أَرْضِهِ مَحَارِمُهُ أَلَا وَإِنَّ فِي الْجَسَدِ مُضْغَةً إِذَا صَلَحَتْ صَلَحَ الْجَسَدُ كُلُّهُ وَإِذَا فَسَدَتْ فَسَدَ الْجَسَدُ كُلُّهُ أَلَا وَهِيَ الْقَلْبُ»

(saw) saying, 'Both legal and illegal things are evident but in between them there are doubtful (suspicious) things and most of the people have no knowledge about them. So whoever saves himself from these suspicious things saves his religion and his honor. And whoever indulges in these suspicious things is like a shepherd who grazes (his animals) near the Hima (private pasture) of someone else and at any moment he is liable to get in it. (O people!) Beware! Every king has a Hima and the Hima of Allah on the earth is His illegal (forbidden) things. Beware! There is a piece of flesh in the body if it becomes good (reformed) the whole body becomes good but if it gets spoilt the whole body gets spoilt and that is the heart” Narrated by Bukhari.

His saying: “like a shepherd who grazes”

This is how in all copies of Al-Bukhari, the answer to the condition (Jawab Ash-Shart) is deleted if “man (from)” is parsed as a conditional. The omission was proven in Al-Darimi’s narration on the authority of Abu Nu’aim, Sheikh of Al-Bukhari. In it, he said, “And whoever falls into the doubtful, falls into the forbidden, like a shepherd who grazes.” It is possible to parse “man” in the context of Bukhari as a connecting word (mawsool) , so it will not have an omission in it, since the decree is that the one who falls into doubts is like a shepherd grazing, and the first is more appropriate because the omission is proven in Sahih Muslim and others through the narration of Zakaria, that the author took it out of it, and based on this, his saying “like a shepherd who grazes” is a resumed sentence and was used by way of representation to point out the witnessed over the absent.

Note: Ibn Aoun said at the end of the Hadith: “I do not know whether the example is from the saying of the Prophet (saw) or from the saying of Al-Sha’bi. Perhaps this is the secret in Al-Bukhari’s deletion of his saying “fall in the Haram” so that what comes before the example becomes connected with it, and is saved from the inclusion claim. What strengthens the absence of inclusion is the previous narration of Ibn Hibban, as well as the confirmation of the proverb being raised in the narration of Ibn Abbas and Ammar bin Yasser as well...”

**I hope that you find this sufficient. Allah Knows Best and is Most Wise.**

**Your Brother**

**Ata Ibn Khalil Abu Al-Rashtah**

9 Ramadan 1445 AH

19/3/2024 CE

**The link to the answer from the Ameer’s Facebook page:**

<https://www.facebook.com/AtaabuAlrashtah.HT/posts/257234480792391>